

19:3 BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL

Symposium on Implementing
Reform of the Patent System

Pages
857
to
1155

Summer
2004

Production: Produced by members of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* on PC computers. All editing and layout is done using Microsoft Word.

Printer: Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska.
Printed in the U.S.A.
The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48—1984.

Copyright © 2004 Regents of the University of California.

All Rights Reserved.

Berkeley Technology Law Journal
University of California, Berkeley
Boalt Hall School of Law
587 Simon Hall
Berkeley, California 94720-7200
(510) 643-6454 (Phone)
(510) 643-6816 (Fax)
btlj@law.berkeley.edu
www.btlj.org

BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL

VOLUME 19

NUMBER 3

SUMMER 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM: IDEAS INTO ACTION: IMPLEMENTING REFORM OF THE PATENT SYSTEM

FOREWORD.....	857
By Mozelle W. Thompson and Susan Stark DeSanti	
TO PROMOTE INNOVATION: THE PROPER BALANCE OF COMPETITION AND PATENT LAW AND POLICY, EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	861
By The Federal Trade Commission	
OBVIOUS TO WHOM? EVALUATING INVENTIONS FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF PHOSITA	885
By Rebecca S. Eisenberg	
ALLOCATING POWER OVER FACT-FINDING IN THE PATENT SYSTEM.....	907
By Arti K. Rai	
REFORMING PATENT VALIDITY LITIGATION: THE “DUBIOUS PREPONDERANCE”	923
By Mark D. Janis	
INCENTIVES TO CHALLENGE AND DEFEND PATENTS: WHY LITIGATION WON’T RELIABLY FIX PATENT OFFICE ERRORS AND WHY ADMINISTRATIVE PATENT REVIEW MIGHT HELP	943
By Joseph Farrell and Robert P. Merges	
THE METAMORPHOSIS OF <i>INTER PARTES</i> REEXAMINATION.....	971
By Stephen G. Kunin and Anton W. Fetting	
POST-GRANT REVIEWS IN THE U.S. PATENT SYSTEM—DESIGN CHOICES AND EXPECTED IMPACT	989
By Bronwyn H. Hall and Dietmar Harhoff	
PATENT SYSTEM REFORM: ECONOMIC ANALYSIS AND CRITIQUE.....	1017
By Carl Shapiro	

EDITED TRANSCRIPT OF REMARKS ON PATENT REFORM: REACTION FROM THE
JUDICIARY 1049
By Judge Ronald M. Whyte

EDITED & EXCERPTED TRANSCRIPT OF THE SYMPOSIUM ON IDEAS INTO ACTION:
IMPLEMENTING REFORM OF THE PATENT SYSTEM 1053

DONORS

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* acknowledges the following generous donors to Boalt Hall's Law and Technology Program:

Benefactors (\$25,000 and above)

COOLEY GODWARD LLP
San Francisco, CA

LATHAM & WATKINS
San Francisco, CA

FARELLA BRAUN + MARTEL LLP
San Francisco, CA

MILBANK, TWEED, HADLEY &
MCCLOY LLP
Palo Alto, CA

FENWICK & WEST LLP
Palo Alto, CA

SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER
& FLOM LLP
Palo Alto, CA

GRAY CARY WARE & FREIDENRICH,
LLP
Palo Alto, CA

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP
Redwood Shores, CA

HELLER EHRMAN WHITE
& MCAULIFFE LLP
San Francisco, CA

WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &
ROSATI
Palo Alto, CA

Members (\$10,000 to \$24,999)

ALSCHULER GROSSMAN STEIN & KAHAN LLP <i>Los Angeles, CA</i>	KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
BINGHAM MCCUTCHEN <i>San Francisco, CA</i>	MAYER, BROWN, ROWE & MAW <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>
COVINGTON & BURLING <i>San Francisco, CA</i>	MCDERMOTT, WILL & EMERY <i>Menlo Park, CA</i>
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL <i>Menlo Park, CA</i>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
DAY CASEBEER MADRID & BATCHELDER LLP <i>Cupertino, CA</i>	MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT & DUNNER LLP <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
FISH & RICHARDSON P.C. <i>Redwood City, CA</i>	ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>	PILLSBURY WINTHROP LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
KIRKLAND & ELLIS <i>San Francisco, CA</i>	RITTER, LANG & KAPLAN <i>Saratoga, CA</i>
	TOWNSEND AND TOWNSEND AND CREW LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>

Patrons (\$5,000 to \$9,999)

BAKER & MCKENZIE <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>	KEKER & VAN NEST LLP <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
DEWEY BALLANTINE LLP <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>	KENYON & KENYON <i>San Jose, CA</i>
FISH & NEAVE <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>	MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS LLP <i>Palo Alto, CA</i>
HOWREY SIMON ARNOLD & WHITE LLP <i>Menlo Park, CA</i>	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON <i>San Francisco, CA</i>
IRELL & MANELLA LLP <i>Century City, CA</i>	VAN PELT & YI LLP <i>Cupertino, CA</i>

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* is a nonprofit organization and welcomes donations. Donors are recognized appropriately for their contributions. For more information, contact the Development Editor, *Berkeley Technology Law Journal*, 587 Simon Hall, Boalt Hall School of Law, University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, (510) 643-6454, or e-mail btlj@law.berkeley.edu.

ADVISORY BOARD

ROBERT C. BERRING, JR.
Walter Perry Johnson Professor of Law
Boalt Hall School of Law
Berkeley, California

ROGER BOROVOY
Fish & Richardson P.C.
Redwood City, California

JESSE H. CHOPER
Earl Warren Professor of Public Law
Boalt Hall School of Law
Berkeley, California

BRIAN C. CUNNINGHAM
Cooley Godward LLP
Palo Alto, California

MARK A. LEMLEY
*Professor of Law and Faculty Scholar &
Director of the Stanford Center for Law,
Science & Technology*
Stanford Law School
Palo Alto, California

REGIS MCKENNA
Chairman & CEO
Regis McKenna, Inc.
Palo Alto, California

PETER S. MENELL
*Professor of Law &
Executive Director of Berkeley Center for
Law & Technology*
Boalt Hall School of Law.
Berkeley, California

ROBERT P. MERGES
*Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati
Professor of Law & Technology &
Director of Berkeley Center for Law &
Technology*
Boalt Hall School of Law
Berkeley, California

MATTHEW D. POWERS
Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP
Redwood Shores, California

DIANE WILKINS SAVAGE
Cooley Godward LLP
Palo Alto, California

LARRY W. SONSINI
Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati
Palo Alto, California

MICHAEL TRAYNOR
Cooley Godward LLP
San Francisco, California

THOMAS F. VILLENEUVE
Gunderson, Dettmer, Stough,
Villeneuve, Franklin & Hachigian, LLP
Menlo Park, California

SUBSCRIBER INFORMATION

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* (ISSN 1086-3818), a continuation of the *High Technology Law Journal* effective Volume 11, is edited and published four times each year (Spring, Summer, Fall, and Annual Review of Law and Technology) by the students of Boalt Hall School of Law, University of California, Berkeley. Application to Mail at Periodicals Postage Rate is Pending at Berkeley, California, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Journal Publications Coordinator, Boalt Hall School of Law, 421 North Addition, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720-7200.

Correspondence. Address all correspondence regarding subscriptions, address changes, claims for nonreceipt, single copies, advertising, and permission to reprint to Journal Publications Coordinator, Boalt Hall School of Law, 421 North Addition, Berkeley, CA 94720-7200; (510) 643-6600; journalpublications@law.berkeley.edu. Authors: see section entitled Information for Authors.

Subscriptions. Annual subscriptions are \$65.00 for individuals, and \$85.00 for organizations. Single issues are \$27.00. Please allow two months for receipt of the first issue. Payment may be made by check, international money order, or credit card (MasterCard/Visa). Domestic claims for nonreceipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication; overseas claims should be made within 180 days. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate (\$27.00) will be charged for replacement. Overseas delivery is not guaranteed.

Form. The text and citations in the *Journal* conform generally to the UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE STYLE MANUAL (28th ed. 1984) and to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 17th ed. 2000). Please cite this issue of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* as 19 BERKELEY TECH. L.J. ____ (2004).

BTLJ ONLINE

Abstracts of all *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* and *High Technology Law Journal* articles as well as the full text of most articles published in previous issues can be found at <http://www.btlj.org>. Our site also contains subject, author and title indexes, general information about the *Journal*, selected materials related to technology law, and links to other related home pages. Subject, author and title indexes may also be found in Volume 10, Number 2 (1995) of the *Journal*.

INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS

The Editorial Board of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts. Submissions may include previously unpublished articles, essays, book reviews, case notes, or comments concerning any aspect of the relationship between technology and the law. If any portion of a manuscript has been previously published, the author should so indicate.

Format. Authors should submit double-spaced, single-sided manuscripts with generous margins. We regret that submissions cannot be returned. Authors should retain an exact copy of any material submitted. Authors may submit manuscripts in electronic or hardcopy form, though electronic submissions are strongly encouraged. Electronic submissions should be sent as attachments in Microsoft Word format to btlj@law.berkeley.edu.

Citations. All citations should conform to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 17th ed. 2000). In addition, the author should include his or her credentials, including full name, degrees earned, academic or professional affiliations, and citations to all previously published legal articles.

Copyrighted Material. If a manuscript contains any copyrighted table, chart, graph, illustration, photograph, or more than eight lines of text, the author must obtain written permission from the copyright holder for use of the material. A photocopy of such written permission should accompany the submission.

Mailing Address. Please submit all hardcopy manuscripts to:

Submissions Editor
Berkeley Technology Law Journal
University of California, Berkeley
Boalt Hall School of Law
587 Simon Hall
Berkeley, California 94720
(510) 643-6454 (Phone)

BOARD OF EDITORS

2003-2004

Editor-in-Chief

TITI NGUYEN

Managing Editor

JOSEPH MARRA

Senior Article Editors

JULIETA LERNER

MARC SHARP

Senior Executive Editor

MATTHEW HOLOHAN

Senior Annual Review Editors

BRIAN PAUL GEARING

ELIZABETH MILES

Submissions Editors

ANDREA FREEMAN
AARON PERZANOWSKI

Production Editor

NATALIA THURSTON

Symposium Editors

ANNA LEE
GEMMA SUH

Article Editors

TOMOMI HARKEY

CHARLES HUSE

CAROL JOHNS

CHARLENE KON

OLGA KOTLYAREVSKAYA

CHRISTEN LEE

SUNNY LU

KATIE NOLAN-STEVAUX

KATHERINE OYAMA

RICHARD R. RONALD

Executive Editors

DANIEL CASTRO

DEAN CHELEY

EUGENE CHOO

RYAN GILFOIL

TERESA HUANG

KRISTOFFER MAYFIELD

LON SORENSEN

RANGANATH SUDARSHAN

TARA WHEATLAND

Submissions Committee

CYNTHIA CHEN

JAMIE MCELYEA