## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

**INTRODUCTION: ANTITRUST, STANDARD ESSENTIAL PATENTS, AND THE FALLACY OF THE ANTICOMMONS TRAGEDY: LEGAL AND INDUSTRIAL POLICY CONCERNS** ................................................................. 1301  
*Sohvi Leih & David J. Teece*

**HAS THE ACADEMY LED PATENT LAW ASTRAY?** ........................................... 1313  
*Jonathan M. Barnett*

**WHY INCENTIVES FOR “PATENT HOLDOUT” THREATEN TO DISMANTLE FRAND, AND WHY IT MATTERS** ................................................................. 1381  
*Richard A. Epstein & Kayvan B. Noroozi*

**THE SMALLEST SALABLE PATENT-PRACTICING UNIT: OBSERVATIONS ON ITS ORIGINS, DEVELOPMENT, AND FUTURE** ........................................... 1433  
*David Kappos & Paul R. Michel*

**LITIGATION OF STANDARDS-ESSENTIAL PATENTS IN EUROPE: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS** ................................................................. 1457  
*Jorge L. Contreras, Fabian Gaessler, Christian Helmers & Brian J. Love*

**THE "TRAGEDY OF THE ANTICOMMONS" FALLACY: A LAW AND ECONOMICS ANALYSIS OF PATENT THICKETS AND FRAND LICENSING** ........... 1489  
*David J. Teece*

**IS THERE AN ANTICOMMONS TRAGEDY IN THE WORLD SMARTPHONE INDUSTRY?** ................................................................. 1527  
*Alexander Galetovic, Stephen Haber & Lew Zaretzki*
SUBSCRIBER INFORMATION

The Berkeley Technology Law Journal (ISSN1086-3818), a continuation of the High Technology Law Journal effective Volume 11, is edited by the students of the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law (Boalt Hall) and is published in print three times each year (March, September, December), with a fourth issue published online only (July), by the Regents of the University of California, Berkeley. Periodicals Postage Rate Paid at Berkeley, CA 94704-9998, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Journal Publications, University of California, Berkeley Law—Library, LL123 Boalt Hall—South Addition, Berkeley, CA 94720-7210.

Correspondence. Address all correspondence regarding subscriptions, address changes, claims for non-receipt, single copies, advertising, and permission to reprint to Journal Publications, University of California, Berkeley Law—Library, LL123 Boalt Hall—South Addition, Berkeley, CA 94705-7210; (510) 643-6600; JournalPublications@law.berkeley.edu. Authors: see section titled Information for Authors.

Subscriptions. Annual subscriptions are $65.00 for individuals and $85.00 for organizations. Single issues are $30.00. Please allow two months for receipt of the first issue. Payment may be made by check, international money order, or credit card (MasterCard/Visa). Domestic claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication; overseas claims should be made within 180 days. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate ($30.00) will be charged for replacement. Overseas delivery is not guaranteed.


BTLJ ONLINE

The full text and abstracts of many previously published Berkeley Technology Law Journal articles can be found at http://www.btlj.org. Our site also contains a cumulative index; general information about the Journal; the Bolt, a collection of short comments and updates about new developments in law and technology written by BTLJ members; and BTLJ Commentaries, an exclusively online publication for pieces that are especially time-sensitive and shorter than typical law review articles.
INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS

The Editorial Board of the Berkeley Technology Law Journal invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts. Submissions may include previously unpublished articles, essays, book reviews, case notes, or comments concerning any aspect of the relationship between technology and the law. If any portion of a manuscript has been previously published, the author should so indicate.

Format. Submissions are accepted in electronic format through the ExpressO online submission system. Authors should include a curriculum vitae and resume when submitting articles, including his or her full name, credentials, degrees earned, academic or professional affiliations, and citations to all previously published legal articles. The ExpressO submission website can be found at http://law.bepress.com/expresso.

Citations. All citations should conform to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass’n et al. eds., 20th ed. 2015).

Copyrighted Material. If a manuscript contains any copyrighted table, chart, graph, illustration, photograph, or more than eight lines of text, the author must obtain written permission from the copyright holder for use of the material.
DONORS

The Berkeley Technology Law Journal and the Berkeley Center for Law & Technology acknowledge the following generous donors to Berkeley Law’s Law and Technology Program:

Partners

COOLEY LLP          FENWICK & WEST LLP

HOGAN LOVELLS       ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP

WHITE & CASE LLP

Benefactors

FISH & RICHARDSON P.C. COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

KASOWITZ BENSON
TORRES & FRIEDMAN LLP

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY

WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP
### Corporate Benefactors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bloomberg Law</th>
<th>Finjan Cybersecurity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Future of Privacy Forum</td>
<td>Google, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inflexion Point</td>
<td>Intel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hewlett Foundation, through the Center for Long-Term Cybersecurity</td>
<td>LitiNomics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microsoft Corporation</td>
<td>Nokia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palantir</td>
<td>The Walt Disney Company</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Members

Baker Botts LLP

Baker & McKenzie LLP

Desmarais LLP

Durie Tangri LLP

Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow, Garrett & Dunner, LLP

Gillin Jacobson Ellis Larsen & Lucey

GTC Law Group LLP & Affiliates

Haynes and Boone, LLP

Irell & Manella LLP

Keker & Van Nest LLP

Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

Knobbe Martens Olson & Bear LLP

Paul Hastings LLP

Ropes & Gray LLP

Simpson Thacher & Bartlett LLP

Turner Boyd LLP

Van Pelt, Yi & James LLP

Weaver Austin Villeneuve & Sampson, LLP
# Board of Editors 2016–2017

**Executive Committee**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Editor-in-Chief</td>
<td>MAX DE LA CAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Editor</td>
<td>CHRIS YANDEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Articles Editors</td>
<td>WAQAS AKMAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CHRISTIAN CHESSMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BILAL MALIK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Scholarship Editor</td>
<td>MARK JOSEPH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Annual Review Editors</td>
<td>JESSICA BRODSKY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CASSY HAVENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JON TANAKA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Executive Editor</td>
<td>ERICA FISHER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Online Content Editor</td>
<td>LIDA RAMSEY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editorial Board**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commentaries Editors</td>
<td>TIFFANY LEUNG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production Editors</td>
<td>KRISTOFER HATCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DUSTIN VANDENBERG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CHELSEA MORI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LOUISE DECOPPET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Review Editors</td>
<td>BARCLAY OUDERSLUYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JOYCE LI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes &amp; Comments Editors</td>
<td>STEPHEN CHAO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>KELSEA CARLSON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submissions Editors</td>
<td>KEVIN CHIU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BRITTANY BRUNS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Content Editor</td>
<td>KATE BRIDGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symposium Editors</td>
<td>VANESSA ING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web &amp; Technology Editors</td>
<td>MICHELLE PARK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member Relations Editor</td>
<td>TAMARA WIESEBRON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alumni Relations Editor</td>
<td>JESSICA ANNIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles Editors</td>
<td>JEREMY ISARD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MEGHAN FENZEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MEI LIU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NOA DREYMANN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TIM HSIEH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Relations Editor</td>
<td>GAVIN MOLER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles Editors</td>
<td>ROBERT OLSSEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MY THAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STEPHEN WILSON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JONATHON MADDERN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BRANDON OREWYLER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALICE CHI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BRIAN HALL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DARIUS DEHGHN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETHAN FRIEDMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FAITH SHAPIRO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JEREMY ISARD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MEGHAN FENZEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MEI LIU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NOA DREYMANN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TIM HSIEH</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MEMBERSHIP
Vol. 32 No. 4

Associate Editors
BLAKE ANDERSON  BRITTANY JOHNSON  ANDREW NGUYEN
ALEX BARATA  YARDEN KAKON  ALYSE RITVO
ANTHONY BEDEL  LAURA KELLY  MERCEDES SEGOVIANO GUILARTE
KATIE BURKHART  ROMAN KRPENIN  ORNAN STEINBERG
EDUARDO CORDOVA SAKIKI  KURT KURZENHAUSER  ERICA SUN
KATHERINE CUMMINGS  ANNIE LEE  SADAF TABATABAI
AMIT ELAZARI  NIR MAOZ  CHANTE WESTMORELAND

Members
LAUREN AZEKA  DARIUS DEGHAN  BIHTER OZEDIRNE
DAVID BEHREND  BROOKES DEGEN  REID PAOLETTA
MARIA BELTRAN  JORDAN FRABONI  RAJAN PATEL
CHRISTOPHER BROWN  ANDREW GLIDDEN  ANDREW SCHMIDT
NIKY BUKOVCAN  ADAM GREENE  NATHAN THEOBALD
ALEXIS CALIGIURI  MARK JAYCOX  AAMIR VIRANI
DEREK CHIPMAN  PATRICK JOHNSON  PAUL WAGNER
ERIC CHUANG  JIMMY JOHNSTON  KEXI WANG
RACHEL DALLAL  AARON LEE  JIHYUN YU
TRENTON DAVIS  DINA LJIEKPERIC  EMRE YUZAK
BLAKE MEREDITH
BTLJ ADVISORY BOARD

JIM DEMPSEY
Executive Director of the
Berkeley Center for Law & Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

ROBERT C. BERRING, JR.
Walter Perry Johnson Professor of Law
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

JIM DEMPSEY
Executive Director of the
Berkeley Center for Law & Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

MATTHEW D. POWERS
Tensegrity Law Group, LLP

PAMELA SAMUELSION
Professor of Law & Information
and Faculty Director of the
Berkeley Center for Law & Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

JESSE H. CHOPER
Earl Warren Professor of Public Law
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

LIONEL S. SOBEL
Visiting Professor of Law
U.C.L.A. School of Law

PETER S. MENELL
Professor of Law and Faculty
Director of the Berkeley Center
for Law & Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

LARRY W. SONSINI
Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati

ROBERT P. MERGES
Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati
Professor of Law and Faculty
Director of the Berkeley Center
for Law & Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

MICHAEL STERN
Cooley LLP

REGIS MCKENNA
Chairman and CEO
Regis McKenna, Inc.

MICHAEL TRAYNOR
Cobalt LLP

DEIRDRE K. MULLIGAN
Assistant Professor and Faculty Director
of the Berkeley Center for
Law and Technology
U.C. Berkeley School of Information

MICHAEL TRAYNOR
Cobalt LLP

JAMES POOLEY
Deputy Director General of the
World Intellectual Property Organization

THOMAS F. VILLENUEVE
Gunderson Dettmer Stough Villeneuve
Franklin & Hachigian LLP
BERKELEY CENTER FOR
LAW & TECHNOLOGY
2016–2017

Executive Director

JIM DEMPSEY

Faculty Directors

KENNETH A. BAMBERGER  PETER S. MENELL  PAMELA SAMUELSON
CATHARINE CRUMP  ROBERT P. MERGES  PAUL SCHWARTZ
CHRIS HOOFNAGLE  DEIRDRE MULLIGAN  JENNIFER URBAN
CATHERINE FISK  SONIA KATYAL  TEJAS NARECHANIA
ANDREA ROTH  MOLLY VAN HOUWELING

Fellows

KATHRYN HASHIMOTO  GRAHAM RAVDIN

Staff Directors

JANN DUDLEY  RICHARD FISK
IRYS SCHENKER  CLAIRE TRIAS