

# **32:4 BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL**

2017

**Pages**

**1301**

**to**

**1558**

Berkeley Technology Law Journal

Volume 32, Number 4

**Production:** Produced by members of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal*.  
All editing and layout done using Microsoft Word.

**Printer:** Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska.  
Printed in the U.S.A.

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48—1984.

**Copyright © 2017 Regents of the University of California.**  
All Rights Reserved.



Berkeley Technology Law Journal  
University of California  
School of Law  
3 Boalt Hall  
Berkeley, California 94720-7200  
btlj@law.berkeley.edu  
<http://www.btlj.org>

# BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL

VOLUME 32

NUMBER 4

2017

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

INTRODUCTION: ANTITRUST, STANDARD ESSENTIAL PATENTS, AND THE FALLACY OF THE ANTICOMMONS TRAGEDY: LEGAL AND INDUSTRIAL POLICY CONCERNS .....	1301
<i>Sohvi Leih &amp; David J. Teece</i>	
HAS THE ACADEMY LED PATENT LAW ASTRAY?.....	1313
<i>Jonathan M. Barnett</i>	
WHY INCENTIVES FOR “PATENT HOLDOUT” THREATEN TO DISMANTLE FRAND, AND WHY IT MATTERS.....	1381
<i>Richard A. Epstein &amp; Kayvan B. Noroozi</i>	
THE SMALLEST SALABLE PATENT-PRACTICING UNIT: OBSERVATIONS ON ITS ORIGINS, DEVELOPMENT, AND FUTURE .....	1433
<i>David Kappos &amp; Paul R. Michel</i>	
LITIGATION OF STANDARDS-ESSENTIAL PATENTS IN EUROPE: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS .....	1457
<i>Jorge L. Contreras, Fabian Gaessler, Christian Helmers &amp; Brian J. Love</i>	
THE "TRAGEDY OF THE ANTICOMMONS" FALLACY: A LAW AND ECONOMICS ANALYSIS OF PATENT THICKETS AND FRAND LICENSING .....	1489
<i>David J. Teece</i>	
IS THERE AN ANTICOMMONS TRAGEDY IN THE WORLD SMARTPHONE INDUSTRY? .....	1527
<i>Alexander Galetovic, Stephen Haber &amp; Lew Zaretski</i>	

## SUBSCRIBER INFORMATION

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* (ISSN1086-3818), a continuation of the *High Technology Law Journal* effective Volume 11, is edited by the students of the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law (Boalt Hall) and is published in print three times each year (March, September, December), with a fourth issue published online only (July), by the Regents of the University of California, Berkeley. Periodicals Postage Rate Paid at Berkeley, CA 94704-9998, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Journal Publications, University of California, Berkeley Law—Library, LL123 Boalt Hall—South Addition, Berkeley, CA 94720-7210.

**Correspondence.** Address all correspondence regarding subscriptions, address changes, claims for non-receipt, single copies, advertising, and permission to reprint to Journal Publications, University of California, Berkeley Law—Library, LL123 Boalt Hall—South Addition, Berkeley, CA 94705-7210; (510) 643-6600; JournalPublications@law.berkeley.edu. *Authors:* see section titled Information for Authors.

**Subscriptions.** Annual subscriptions are \$65.00 for individuals and \$85.00 for organizations. Single issues are \$30.00. Please allow two months for receipt of the first issue. Payment may be made by check, international money order, or credit card (MasterCard/Visa). Domestic claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication; overseas claims should be made within 180 days. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate (\$30.00) will be charged for replacement. Overseas delivery is not guaranteed.

**Form.** The text and citations in the *Journal* conform generally to the THE CHICAGO MANUAL OF STYLE (16th ed. 2010) and to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 20th ed. 2015). Please cite this issue of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* as 32 BERKELEY TECH. L.J. \_\_\_\_ (2017).

## BTLJ ONLINE

The full text and abstracts of many previously published *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* articles can be found at <http://www.btlj.org>. Our site also contains a cumulative index; general information about the *Journal*; the *Bolt*, a collection of short comments and updates about new developments in law and technology written by BTLJ members; and *BTLJ Commentaries*, an exclusively online publication for pieces that are especially time-sensitive and shorter than typical law review articles.

## INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS

The Editorial Board of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts. Submissions may include previously unpublished articles, essays, book reviews, case notes, or comments concerning any aspect of the relationship between technology and the law. If any portion of a manuscript has been previously published, the author should so indicate.

**Format.** Submissions are accepted in electronic format through the ExpressO online submission system. Authors should include a curriculum vitae and resume when submitting articles, including his or her full name, credentials, degrees earned, academic or professional affiliations, and citations to all previously published legal articles. The ExpressO submission website can be found at <http://law.bepress.com/expresso>.

**Citations.** All citations should conform to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 20th ed. 2015).

**Copyrighted Material.** If a manuscript contains any copyrighted table, chart, graph, illustration, photograph, or more than eight lines of text, the author must obtain written permission from the copyright holder for use of the material.

# DONORS

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* and the Berkeley Center for Law & Technology acknowledge the following generous donors to Berkeley Law's Law and Technology Program:

## Partners

COOLEY LLP

FENWICK & WEST LLP

HOGAN LOVELLS

ORRICK, HERRINGTON &  
SUTCLIFFE LLP

WHITE & CASE LLP

## Benefactors

FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

KASOWITZ BENSON  
TORRES & FRIEDMAN LLP

WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE  
AND DORR LLP

MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY

WILSON SONSINI  
GOODRICH & ROSATI

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

## Corporate Benefactors

BLOOMBERG LAW

FINJAN CYBERSECURITY

FUTURE OF PRIVACY FORUM

GOOGLE, INC.

INFLEXION POINT

INTEL

HEWLETT FOUNDATION, THROUGH  
THE CENTER FOR LONG-TERM  
CYBERSECURITY

LITINOMICS

MICROSOFT CORPORATION

NOKIA

PALANTIR

THE WALT DISNEY COMPANY

## Members

BAKER BOTTS LLP

KEKER & VAN NEST LLP

BAKER & MCKENZIE LLP

KILPATRICK TOWNSEND &  
STOCKTON LLP

DESMARAIS LLP

KNOBBE MARTENS  
OLSON & BEAR LLP

DURIE TANGRI LLP

PAUL HASTINGS LLP

FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,  
GARRETT & DUNNER, LLP

ROPES & GRAY LLP

GILLIN JACOBSON ELLIS  
LARSEN & LUCEY

SIMPSON THACHER & BARTLETT LLP

GTC LAW GROUP LLP & AFFILIATES

TURNER BOYD LLP

HAYNES AND BOONE, LLP

VAN PELT, YI & JAMES LLP

IRELL & MANELLA LLP

WEAVER AUSTIN VILLENEUVE &  
SAMPSON, LLP



# BOARD OF EDITORS

# 2016–2017

---

## *Executive Committee*

---

*Editor-in-Chief*  
MAX DE LA CAL

*Managing Editor*  
CHRIS YANDEL

*Senior Scholarship  
Editor*  
MARK JOSEPH

*Senior Articles Editors*  
WAQAS AKMAL  
CHRISTIAN CHESSMAN  
BILAL MALIK

*Senior Annual Review Editors*  
JESSICA BRODSKY  
CASSY HAVENS  
JON TANAKA

*Senior Executive Editor*  
ERICA FISHER

*Senior Online Content  
Editor*  
LIDA RAMSEY

---

## *Editorial Board*

---

*Commentaries Editors*  
TIFFANY LEUNG

*Production Editors*  
KRISTOFER HATCH  
DUSTIN VANDENBERG  
CHELSEA MORI  
LOUISE DECOPPET

*Technical Editors*  
AYN SU WOODWARD  
RICHARD SIMS

*Annual Review Editors*  
BARCLAY OUDERSLUYS  
JOYCE LI

*Notes & Comments Editors*  
STEPHEN CHAO  
KELSEA CARLSON

*Symposium Editors*  
VANESSA ING  
MICHELLE PARK

*Submissions Editors*  
KEVIN CHIU  
BRITTANY BRUNS

*Online Content Editor*  
KATE BRIDGE

*Web & Technology  
Editors*  
JOE CRAIG  
TED KANG

*Member Relations Editor*  
TAMARA WIESEBRON

*Alumni Relations Editor*  
JESSICA ANNIS

*External Relations Editor*  
GAVIN MOLER

ALICE CHI  
BRIAN HALL  
DARIUS DEGHAN  
ETHAN FRIEDMAN  
FAITH SHAPIRO

*Articles Editors*  
JEREMY ISARD  
MEGHAN FENZEL  
MEI LIU  
NOA DREYMAN  
TIM HSIEH

ROBERT OLSEN  
MY THAN  
STEPHEN WILSON  
JONATHON MADDERN  
BRANDON OREWYLER

# MEMBERSHIP

Vol. 32 No. 4

---

## *Associate Editors*

---

BLAKE ANDERSON	BRITTANY JOHNSON	ANDREW NGUYEN
ALEX BARATA	YARDEN KAKON	ALYSE RITVO
ANTHONY BEDEL	LAURA KELLY	MERCEDES SEGOVIANO
KATIE BURKHART	ROMAN KRUPENIN	GUILARTE
EDUARDO CORDOVA	KURT KURZENHAUSER	ORNAN STEINBERG
SAKIKI	ANNIE LEE	ERICA SUN
KATHERINE CUMMINGS	NIR MAOZ	SADAF TABATABAI
AMIT ELAZARI	CHARLES MILLER	CHANTE
		WESTMORELAND

## *Members*

---

LAUREN AZEKA	DARIUS DEGHAN	BIHTER OZEDIRNE
DAVID BEHREND	BROOKES DEGEN	REID PAOLETTA
MARIA BELTRAN	JORDAN FRABONI	RAJAN PATEL
CHRISTOPHER BROWN	ANDREW GLIDDEN	ANDREW SCHMIDT
NIKY BUKOVCAN	ADAM GREENE	NATHAN THEOBALD
ALEXIS CALIGIURI	MARK JAYCOX	AAMIR VIRANI
DEREK CHIPMAN	PATRICK JOHNSON	PAUL WAGNER
ERIC CHUANG	JIMMY JOHNSTON	KEXI WANG
RACHEL DALLAL	AARON LEE	JIHYUN YU
TRENTON DAVIS	DINA LJEKPERIC	EMRE YUZAK
	BLAKE MEREDITH	

# BTLJ ADVISORY BOARD

JIM DEMPSEY  
*Executive Director of the  
Berkeley Center for Law & Technology*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

ROBERT C. BERRING, JR.  
*Walter Perry Johnson Professor of Law*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

MATTHEW D. POWERS  
Tensegrity Law Group, LLP

JESSE H. CHOPER  
*Earl Warren Professor of Public Law*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

PAMELA SAMUELSON  
*Professor of Law & Information  
and Faculty Director of the  
Berkeley Center for Law & Technology*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

PETER S. MENELL  
*Professor of Law and Faculty  
Director of the Berkeley Center  
for Law & Technology*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

LIONEL S. SOBEL  
*Visiting Professor of Law*  
U.C.L.A. School of Law

ROBERT P. MERGES  
*Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati  
Professor of Law and Faculty  
Director of the Berkeley Center  
for Law & Technology*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Law

LARRY W. SONSINI  
Wilson Sonsini Goodrich & Rosati

REGIS MCKENNA  
*Chairman and CEO*  
Regis McKenna, Inc.

MICHAEL STERN  
Cooley LLP

DEIRDRE K. MULLIGAN  
*Assistant Professor and Faculty Director  
of the Berkeley Center for  
Law and Technology*  
U.C. Berkeley School of Information

MICHAEL TRAYNOR  
Cobalt LLP

JAMES POOLEY  
*Deputy Director General of the  
World Intellectual Property Organization*

THOMAS F. VILLENEUVE  
Gunderson Dettmer Stough Villeneuve  
Franklin & Hachigian LLP

# BERKELEY CENTER FOR LAW & TECHNOLOGY 2016–2017

---

## *Executive Director*

---

JIM DEMPSEY

## *Faculty Directors*

---

KENNETH A. BAMBERGER PETER S. MENELL PAMELA SAMUELSON

CATHERINE CRUMP ROBERT P. MERGES PAUL SCHWARTZ

CHRIS HOOFNAGLE DEIRDRE MULLIGAN JENNIFER URBAN

CATHERINE FISK SONIA KATYAL TEJAS NARECHANIA

ANDREA ROTH MOLLY VAN HOUWELING

## *Fellows*

---

KATHRYN HASHIMOTO

GRAHAM RAVDIN

## *Staff Directors*

---

JANN DUDLEY

RICHARD FISK

IRYS SCHENKER

CLAIRE TRIAS