

# BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL

VOLUME 38, SPECIAL ISSUE

SYMPOSIUM: THE IMPACT OF THE PATENT SYSTEM ON MARKETS FOR  
TECHNOLOGY

2023

**Pages**

**253–608**

**Production:** Produced by members of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal*.

The Articles within this issue are derived from presentations delivered at the Berkeley-NYU Symposium entitled *The Impact of the Patent System on Markets for Technology*, held at the University of California, Berkeley, Haas School of Business on February 23–24, 2023. The TIIP Program at the Classical Liberal Institute (NYU School of Law), Berkeley Center for Law and Technology (BCLT), and the Tusher Center, Institute for Business Innovation, Haas School of Business jointly hosted the symposium. Thank you to the contributors for their help in organizing the symposium and for sharing their work with us.

All editing and layout done using Microsoft Word.

**Printer:** Joe Christensen, Inc., Lincoln, Nebraska.  
Printed in the U.S.A.

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48—1984.

**Copyright © 2023. Regents of the University of California.**  
All Rights Reserved.



Berkeley Technology Law Journal  
University of California  
School of Law  
3 Law Building  
Berkeley, California 94720-7200  
editor@btlj.org  
<https://www.btlj.org>

# BERKELEY TECHNOLOGY LAW JOURNAL

VOLUME 38

SPECIAL ISSUE

2023

## ARTICLES

FOREWORD .....	253
<i>Robert Merges</i>	
ANTITRUST MERCANTILISM: THE STRATEGIC DEVALUATION OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS IN WIRELESS MARKETS .....	259
<i>Jonathan Barnett</i>	
PROTECTING INNOVATION IN THE MOBILE WIRELESS ECOSYSTEM: UNDERSTANDING AND ADDRESSING “HOLD-OUT” .....	313
<i>Kalyan Dasgupta &amp; David Teece</i>	
HOW WEAK ARE STRONG PATENTS: PATENT HOLDOUT AND SMALL(ER) TECHNOLOGY FIRMS .....	349
<i>Bowman Heiden &amp; Matthew Rappaport</i>	
HIT THE ROAD, JACK: THE AUTO INDUSTRY AS THE NEXT VEHICLE FOR PREDATORY INFRINGEMENT .....	425
<i>Kristen Jakobsen Osenga</i>	
THE 2022 IEEE IPR POLICY CHANGES: LEGAL AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS.....	445
<i>Manveen Singh</i>	
PAY NO ATTENTION TO THE COMPARABLE BEHIND THE CURTAIN! THE HARMS OF OPACITY IN STANDARD ESSENTIAL PATENT LICENSING .....	463
<i>Barbara Lauriat</i>	
PATENT INJUNCTIONS AND THE FRAND COMMITMENT: A CASE STUDY IN THE ETSI INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS POLICY.....	487
<i>Adam Mossoff</i>	
PATENTS AS HEDGES.....	515
<i>Ted Sichelman</i>	
EVIDENCE OF SYSTEMATIC PATENT HOLDOUT .....	575
<i>Kirti Gupta &amp; Urška Petrovčič</i>	

## SUBSCRIBER INFORMATION

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* (ISSN1086-3818), a continuation of the *High Technology Law Journal* effective Volume 11, is edited by the students of the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law and is published in print three times each year (March, September, December), with a fourth issue published online only (July), by the Regents of the University of California, Berkeley. Periodicals Postage Rate Paid at Berkeley, CA 94704-9998, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Journal Publications, Law Library, LL123 South Addition, Berkeley Law, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA 94720-7210.

**Correspondence.** Address all correspondence regarding subscriptions, address changes, claims for non-receipt, single copies, advertising, and permission to reprint to Journal Publications, Law Library, LL123 South Addition, Berkeley Law, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA 94720-7210; (510) 643-6600; [JournalPublications@law.berkeley.edu](mailto:JournalPublications@law.berkeley.edu). *Authors:* see section titled Information for Authors.

**Subscriptions.** Annual subscriptions are \$65.00 for individuals and \$85.00 for organizations. Single issues are \$30.00. Please allow two months for receipt of the first issue. Payment may be made by check, international money order, or credit card (MasterCard/Visa). Domestic claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication; overseas claims should be made within 180 days. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate (\$30.00) will be charged for replacement. Overseas delivery is not guaranteed.

**Form.** The text and citations in the *Journal* conform generally to THE CHICAGO MANUAL OF STYLE (16th ed. 2010) and to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 21st ed. 2020). Please cite this issue of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* as 38 BERKELEY TECH. L.J. \_\_\_\_ (2023).

# BTLJ ONLINE

The full text and abstracts of many previously published *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* articles can be found at <https://www.btlj.org>. Our site also contains a cumulative index; general information about the *Journal*; the *BTLJ Blog*, a collection of short comments and updates about new developments in law and technology written by BTLJ members; and *BTLJ Commentaries*, an exclusively online publication for pieces that are especially time-sensitive and shorter than typical law review articles.

## INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS

The Editorial Board of the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* invites the submission of unsolicited manuscripts. Submissions may include previously unpublished articles, essays, book reviews, case notes, or comments concerning any aspect of the relationship between technology and the law. If any portion of a manuscript has been previously published, the author should so indicate.

**Format.** Submissions are accepted in electronic format through Scholastica online submission system. Authors should include a curriculum vitae and resume when submitting articles, including his or her full name, credentials, degrees earned, academic or professional affiliations, and citations to all previously published legal articles. The Scholastica submission website can be found at <https://btlj.scholasticahq.com/for-authors>.

**Citations.** All citations should conform to THE BLUEBOOK: A UNIFORM SYSTEM OF CITATION (Columbia Law Review Ass'n et al. eds., 21st ed. 2020).

**Copyrighted Material.** If a manuscript contains any copyrighted table, chart, graph, illustration, photograph, or more than eight lines of text, the author must obtain written permission from the copyright holder for use of the material.

# SPONSORS

## 2022–23

The *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* and the Berkeley Center for Law & Technology acknowledge the following generous sponsors of Berkeley Law's Law and Technology Program:

ALLEN & OVERY LLP	AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER LLP
BAKER MCKENZIE	BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP	CHARLES RIVER ASSOCIATES
COOLEY LLP	CORNERSTONE RESEARCH
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP	DESMARAIS LLP
DLA PIPER	DURIE TANGRI LLP
FENWICK & WEST LLP	FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.
GENENTECH, INC.	GEN LAW FIRM
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP	GILEAD SCIENCES, INC.
GREENBERG TRAUERIG, LLP	GTC LAW GROUP PC
HAYNES AND BOONE, LLP	HOGAN LOVELLS
IRELL & MANELLA LLP	JINGTIAN & GONGCHENG
JONES DAY	KEKER, VAN NEST & PETERS LLP
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON LLP	KING & SPALDING LLP

# SPONSORS

## 2022–23

KING & WOOD MALLESONS	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
KNOBBE MARTENS	LATHAM & WATKINS LLP
MARKS & CLERK	MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY
MICROSOFT	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP	OCEAN TOMO
ORRICK HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP	PAUL HASTINGS, LLP
QUALCOMM TECHNOLOGIES, INC.	QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP
ROBINS KAPLAN LLP	ROPES & GRAY LLP
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP	TENSEGRITY LAW GROUP LLP
VAN PELT, YI & JAMES LLP	VIA LICENSING CORPORATION
WANHUIDA INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY	WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP
WESTERN DIGITAL CORPORATION	WHITE & CASE LLP
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP	WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP	WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON

# BOARD OF EDITORS

## 2022–23

---

### *Executive Board*

---

*Editors-in-Chief*  
 DYLAN HOULE  
 JESSICA LI

*Managing Editor*  
 THOMAS MATTES

*Sr. Executive Editor*  
 RYAN CAMPBELL

*Sr. Articles Editors*  
 LUCILLE DAI-HE  
 MARIAN LEE  
 ROSS MOODY

*Sr. Online Content Editors*  
 AL MALECHA  
 KATHERINE WANG

*Sr. Student Publications Editors*  
 SHIH-WEI CHAO  
 REBECCA HO

*Sr. Scholarship Editor*  
 WILL KASPER

*Sr. Production Editor*  
 SARAH DAVIDSON

---

### *Editorial Board*

---

*Articles Editors*  
 KEATON BLAZER  
 BRANDON DAILEY  
 BRIGITTE DESNOES  
 MATTHEW LUEVANO  
 LAWRENCE MYUNG  
 ELIZABETH OH  
 NIKKI SEICHEPINE  
 YUHAN WU  
 ROBERT ZHU

*Notes & Comments Editor*  
 NOAH COHEN

*Student Publication Editor*  
 KATE BULGER

*Submissions Editors*  
 ABRAHAM (ABIE)  
 BRAUNER  
 HYO JIN JEONG  
 ANNIE KIM  
 KERMIT RODRIGUEZ

*Technical Editors*  
 CHIAGOZIEM  
 MARK ANEKE  
 ZHUDI HUANG  
 CARESSA TSAI  
 SOPHIE ZOLLMAN

*Alumni Relations Editor*  
 EVA SPITZEN

*External Relations Editor*  
 PRIMAVERA MARTINEZ

*Jr. Production Editors*  
 SEUNGHAN BAE  
 ALEX LE

*Podcast Editor*  
 ISABEL JONES

*Jr. Podcast Editor*  
 ERIC AHERN

BHAVYA SUKHAVASI  
 ZOE SUN

*Member Relations Editors*  
 JAEYOUNG CHOI  
 PAYTON FONG

*Symposium Editors*  
 MEAGHAN KATZ  
 HUNTER KOLON

*Web & Technology Editors*  
 LINDA CHANG  
 PETER JOHNSTON



# MEMBERSHIP

## 2022–23

### *Members*

---

AKSHAT AGRAWAL	NORA AL HENAKI	NOOR ALANIZI
BRIAN ANDERSON	LAURAN BARLAND	HARVINDER (HARRY) BASSI
ANVITA BHANDARI	MARIT BJORN LUND	NICOLE BOUCHER
TIFFANEY BOYD	CARLISLE BOYLE	KATHY BUI
EMMA BURKE	ELLEN CAEN	ANGELICA CAMELO
ADRIANA CRISTINA CASADO BARRAL	JENNIFER CHENG	NIDHI CHIKKERUR
ALEX CHOI	TANISHA CHOUDHARY	WILLIAM CLARK
OWEN COOPER	DAISY CORONA	MAYA DARROW
ADAM DAVID	MAX DAVIS	UDIT DEDHIYA
HEATHER DEMOCKER	MICHELLE D'SOUZA	VERNON ESPINOZA
ASHLEY FAN	JOE FITZPATRICK	LAURA FORERO
BRIONNE FRAZIER	ALEXANDER GONZALEZ-TORRES	DYLAN GOOD
ANAN HAFEZ	LYNN HE	JISOO HONG
ELLEN JIN	CLEA JULLIEN	BRITTA KAJIMURA
SHREYA KAPOOR	PHILIP KATZ	JOHN KAUFFMAN
SHABRINA DEFI KHANSA	JUNG KIM	BEN KING
GULBABIL KOKVER	THELMA CRISTEL KRISTJÁNSDÓTTIR	CYRUS KUSHA
JENNA KWAK	JESSICA KWOK	KRISTY LAM
JOY LEE	CRYSTAL LEE	MADISON ANN LEE

# MEMBERSHIP

## 2022–23

*Members (continued)*

---

YAOQI LI	YU-JEN LIU	ANGELA MA
MARLEY MACAREWICH	MAHIMA MADAN	HARSHINI MALLI
BAILEY MALVEAUX	ANYA MANSOOR	ROBIN MARSHALL
GARRETH MCCRUDDEN	EDLENE MIGUEL	JOSH MIMURA
SUMAN MISHRA	JOHN MOORE	KEVIN NAVI
KAYLA NGUYEN	ANDREW OLIVEI	OLUWAPELUMI (PELUMI) OMONIYI
DAMILOLA OYEBAYO	HYEMI PARK	BEN PEARCE
ALESSANDRA POTINI	RUOYIN QI	JAANVI RATHI
KRITI RATHI	SAYAKA REED	SAMUEL REISS
JOE ROSS	CHRIS ROZOLIS	BANI SAPRA
RIDHIMA SAXENA	SIMONE SCHÜRCH	MASON SEDEN-HANSEN
SAKSHI SHARM	PAVANA SHIVAKUMAR UDASI	AISHWARYA SIHAG
ELIZABETH BASANA VALERIE SIMANJUNTAK	IAN SMITH	ANDREA SOTELO GASPERI
UTKARSH SRIVASTAVA	SANDEEP STANLEY	ANDREW STONE
CEM TEBER	SANSERN TEJSIHADHANANANDA	YAVUZ USAKLIOGLU
PEINING WANG	EMILY WELSCH	DOMINICK WILLIAMS
YIPING XU	YING (ELECTRA) YAO	JJ YOUNG
ENID YU	NICOLE ZEINSTR	YICHEN ZHANG
NINA ZHANG	BOJUN ZHAO	

**BERKELEY CENTER FOR  
LAW & TECHNOLOGY  
2022–23**

---

*Executive Director*

WAYNE STACY

---

*Staff*

MARK COHEN  
*Sr. Fellow & Director,  
BCLT Asia IP Project*

ALLISON SCHMITT  
*Fellow & Director,  
BCLT Life Sciences Project*

JANN DUDLEY  
*Associate Director*

RICHARD FISK  
*Assistant Director,  
Events & Communications*

IRYS SCHENKER  
*Office Administrator*

JUSTIN TRI DO  
*Media Coordinator*

ABRIL DELGADO  
*Events Specialist*

---

*Fellow*

YUAN HAO  
*Senior Fellow*

KATHRYN HASHIMOTO  
*Copyright Law Fellow*

RAMYA CHANDRASEKHAR  
*Biometric Regulatory Fellow*

ROBERT BARR  
*Executive Director Emeritus*

# BERKELEY CENTER FOR LAW & TECHNOLOGY

## 2022–23

### *Faulty Directors*

---

KENNETH A. BAMBERGER  
*The Rosalinde and  
Arthur Gilbert Foundation  
Professor of Law*

CATHERINE CRUMP  
*Robert Glushko Clinical  
Professor of Practice in  
Technology Law and Director,  
Samuelson Law, Technology  
and Public Policy Clinic*

CATHERINE FISK  
*Barbara Nachtrieb Armstrong  
Professor of Law*

CHRIS JAY HOOFNAGLE  
*Professor of Law in Residence*

SONIA KATYAL  
*Roger J. Traynor  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
and Associate Dean, Faculty  
Development and Research*

ORIN S. KERR  
*William G. Simon  
Professor of Law*

PETER S. MENELL  
*Koret Professor of Law*

ROBERT P. MERGES  
*Wilson Sonsini Goodrich &  
Rosati Professor of Law*

DEIRDRE K. MULLIGAN  
*Professor in the  
School of Information*

TEJAS N. NARECHANIA  
*Robert and Nanci Corson  
Assistant Professor of Law*

OSAGIE K. OBASOGIE  
*Haas Distinguished Chair,  
Professor of Law, and  
Professor of Bioethics*

ANDREA ROTH  
*Professor of Law*

PAMELA SAMUELSON  
*Richard M. Sherman  
Distinguished Professor of Law*

PAUL SCHWARTZ  
*Jefferson E. Peyser  
Professor of Law*

ERIK STALLMAN  
*Assistant Clinical Professor  
and Associate Director,  
Samuelson Law, Technology &  
Public Policy Clinic*

JENNIFER M. URBAN  
*Clinical Professor of Law  
and Director, Samuelson  
Law, Technology &  
Public Policy Clinic*

MOLLY VAN HOUWELING  
*Harold C. Hobbach  
Distinguished Professor of  
Patent Law and  
Intellectual Property*

REBECCA WEXLER  
*Assistant Professor of Law*